5781 – אברהם מנינג rabbi@rabbimanning.com 1

HALACHIC AND HASHKAFIC ISSUES IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY

201 - BERACHOT ON CHOCOLATE

AND THE TRICKY CASE OF CHOCOLATE-COATED RAISINS
OU ISRAEL CENTER - WINTER 2020/21

- We looked in the previous two shiurim at issues relating to bircot hashevach and bircot hamitzvot. In this shiur we will turn to one (of the many) halachic issues connected to bircot hanehenin.
- Chocolate has become a big part of our lives! Both in pure form and also as a coating around other things we, especially in the Western world, consume very significant amounts of it:-
 - Worldwide consumption of chocolate every year is estimated to be at least 7.2 million metric tons.
 - Net sales of Mars Inc., a leading producer of chocolate productions, are over \$17 billion every year.
 - The annual estimated sales of chocolate around the world contribute \$83 billion to the global economy1.
- As we shall see, not only is chocolate a major player in food consumption, it is also a fascinating case study in halacha too, in particular hilchot berachot².

A] THE HISTORY OF CHOCOLATE

- Chocolate is native to southern Mexico and Central America, where the Olmecs (as early as 1500 BCE) and later the Mayans and the Aztecs, cultivated the cacao (Europeans later switched around the vowels to spell it cocoa) tree for thousands of years. The word chocolate originates from the classical Nahuatl word Xocolatl, meaning 'warm liquid', since warm, unsweetened chocolate was drunk by Aztec royalty from golden goblets³. Cocoa beans were also used as currency.
- The Spaniards transported cocoa trees to Europe⁴. Later, industrialists developed vast plantations of cocoa trees in Africa, Indonesia, and other tropical areas.
- Although the Native Americans drank their chocolate unsweetened, the Spaniards added sugar to it. This created two industries the cocoa industry and the sugar industry.
- 1580 hot chocolate flavored with sugar and vanilla was a common Spanish drink, and from there it eventually spread to the rest of Europe.
- 1641 Chocolate arrives in Florida
- 1682 First American chocolate house opens in Boston.
- 1729 The first mechanical cocoa grinder was invented in Bristol, UK. The patent for a chocolate refining process was later bought by J. S. Fry & Sons in 1761.
- 1847 the first <u>solid</u> chocolate bar was produced by Fry's of Bristol. Until then, chocolate had only been consumed as a drink.
- 1866 Fry's Chocolate Cream became the first mass-produced chocolate bar.
- 1876 Swiss chocolatier, Daniel Peter, devised a method of adding milk to chocolate, creating milk chocolate. Prior to this invention, all chocolate was *pareve*.
- 1879 Swiss chocolatier, Rudolf Lindt, invented the conch machine which mixed and aerated chocolate giving it a smooth consistency that blends well with other ingredients.
- By the late 19th/early 20th century, family chocolate companies such as Cadbury, Mars, Nestle and Hershey were mass-producing a variety of chocolate confections to meet the growing demand.



- 1. See https://brandongaille.com/26-incredible-chocolate-consumption-statistics/
- For articles on the subject see: https://rabbikaganoff.com/tag/chocolate/, https://www.theyeshivaworld.com/news/headlines-breaking-stories/362964/the-halachos-and-kashrus-of-chocolate.html https://oukosher.org/blog/articles/chocolate-production/
- 3. In 1568, Bernal Díaz, who accompanied Cortés in the conquest of Mexico, wrote of this encounter which he witnessed: From time to time they served him [Montezuma] in cups of pure gold a certain drink made from cacao. It was said that it gave one power over women, but this I never saw. I did see them bring in more than fifty large pitchers of cacao with froth in it, and he drank some of it, the women serving with great reverence.
- 4. Christopher Columbus encountered the cacao bean on his fourth mission to the Americas on August 15, 1502, when he and his crew seized a large native canoe that proved to contain among other goods for trade, cacao beans. Spanish conquistador, Hernán Cortés, may have been the first European to encounter chocolate when he observed it in the court of Montezuma in 1519.
- 5. Some European manufacturers add animal fat to chocolate, making it non-kosher. This means that the production line must be kashered before kosher chocolate can be made on it. Kashering will also be needed where the plant is used to make milk chocolate and a run of parev chocolate is required. Due to the extreme sensitivity of the chocolate making process to water, chocolatiers are very reluctant to use allow any water into their machinery for kashering. This raises the question as to whether the plant can be kashered with an alternative liquid ie the first run of chocolate! The Rema (OC 452) quotes the opinion of the Rashba that, bedieved, other liquids can be used for kashering and some hechsherim rely on this under exceptional circumstances. However, many poskim (including R. Moshe Feinstein, Igrot Moshe YD 1:60) rule that chocolate liquor is too viscous to be permitted as a kashering liquid, even bedieved. It is also solid at room temperature and many poskim do not class it as a liquid at all. As such, chocolate plants are typically kashered with oils which are liquid at room temperature (eg soybean, canola, and sunflower oil). Some authorities allow a 'chocolate run kashering' from milky to parev but not from treif to kosher.

B] HOW IS CHOCOLATE MADE

- The cacao tree grows with large, colored fruits the size of melons or small pineapples that hang from the branches and trunk of the tree. Each huge fruit contains a sticky pulp that holds about 20-50 almond-shaped seeds, that are usually called cocoa beans.
- The beans are separated from the pulp, fermented for about a week, dried in the sun, and then shipped to a chocolatier.
- The chocolatier roasts the beans to bring out the flavor, and then winnows the beans to remove the shell from the meat of the bean, leaving the kernel (nib). The nib is ground and becomes a thick, viscous liquid called chocolate liquor. The bean turns into a liquid when it is ground, because it contains over 50% fat. This pure chocolate liquor is the bitter, unsweetened chocolate similar to that drunk by the Aztecs.
- The chocolatier separates the cocoa liquor using a hydraulic press⁶ into (i) fat, or cocoa butter; and (ii) cocoa bean solids. The solids are ground into cocoa powder.
- Our chocolate consists of a mix of chocolate liquor, cocoa butter, and cocoa powder, together with other ingredients: usually sugar, milk (powder⁷), lecithin and lactose.
- The product is ground fine in a conch machine where the ingredients are blended at a very high temperature⁸ and speed. This gives it a smooth consistency and taste.
- The chocolate is then tempered heated slowly and then cooled slowly to enable it to harden properly without the cocoa butter separating from the chocolate.
- Finally, the chocolate is flavored and shaped, ready for sale.
- White chocolate is made from cocoa butter, sugar, and often milk. It does not contain cocoa solids. Some fake 'white chocolate' products are actually made from vegetable oil and chocolate flavoring instead of cocoa butter.



C] THE BERACHA ON CHOCOLATE

C1] HALACHIC PRINCIPLES

משנה א - כיצד מברכין על הפירות! על פירות האילן אומר 'בורא פרי העץ'. חוץ מן היין, שעל היין אומר 'בורא פרי הגפן'. ועל פירות הארץ אומר 'בורא פרי האדמה'. חוץ מן הפת, שעל הפת הוא אומר 'המוציא לחם מן הארץ'. ועל הירקות אומר בורא פרי האדמה. רבי יהודה אומר בורא מיני דשאים.

משנה ב - ברך על פירות האילן בורא פרי האדמה, יצא. ועל פירות הארץ בורא פרי העץ, לא יצא. על כולם אם אמר שהכל נהיה יצא.

משנה מסכת ברכות פרק ו

1.

The Mishna rules that on fruit growing from a tree, one makes 'borei peri haetz' and on vegetables one makes 'borei peri ha' adama'. If one made 'shehakol nihiye bidvaro' on any fruit or vegetable, that apparently also works.

- Chocolate is made from a tree fruit. The starting position should therefore be that its beracha is 'borei peri haetz'.
- However, the chocolate that we eat has been highly processed since it was on the tree! The seeds have been removed from the cacao fruit, and have then been fermented, dried, roasted, shelled, ground, liquefied, separated again, ground again, mixed with milk and/or cocoa butter, ground yet again in a conch, tempered, flavored and shaped.

^{6.} The press operates at temperature of around 200°F and the chocolate products will therefore be considered mevushal - cooked for the purposes of hilchot Shabbat and not simply roasted. This will impact on the way in which hot cocoa is made on Shabbat.

^{7.} Chocolatiers are reluctant to use liquid milk since its water content can damage the highly sensitive chocolate making process. Powdered milk raises the question of whether it is included in the gezeira of chalav akum. R. Tzvi Pesach Frank wrote a famous teshuva (Har Tzvi YD 103) where he rules that the prohibition of chalav akum only applies when the milk is in its original form, but does not apply if the milk changed form (eg into powder). This is similar to the leniency mentioned in Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 115:3 regarding butter. The Chazon Ish (YD 41:4) disagreed with this leniency and ruled that powered milk remains prohibited. For those who follow the leniency of the Har Tzvi, this issue is very relevant to chocolate. Some chocolate is however made with liquid milk, and one cannot assume that powdered milk was used. Some poskim maintain that once milk is in a chocolate state it is already a changed form and would automatically qualify for this leniency - see https://oukosher.org/blog/articles/chocolate-production/

^{8.} As to the issue of bishul akum, most poskim rules that chocolate is NOT prohibited due it it being cooked by non-Jews. Although cocoa beans are not edible raw, and chocolate is served at high-class affairs (which should necessitate bishul Yisrael), R. Hershel Schachter permits the chocolate due to a combination of two heterim. One is that chocolate is not served to enhance bread. This opinion is expressed by many Rishonim, although is not generally relied upon alone. There is also a psak from Rav Moshe Feinstein (quoted by R. Nota Greenblatt) in which he rules that there is no prohibition of bishul akum on food made in commercial factories (see also Shu't Minchat Yitzchak 3:26 and 10:67). While the OU does not rely on these heterim alone, it combines them to exempt chocolate from bishul Yisrael. Additionally bishul akum applies only to foods that play a primary function at a high-class meal. Chocolate is consumed only in small amounts and plays a minor role, even at a state dinner. Other poskim suggest that, since the heat from the conches is generated from the friction of the rollers, it is comparable to an unusual method of cooking, which is not subject to bishul akum.

^{9.} The Shulchan Aruch (OC 202:18) rules that 'shehakol' may be made when in doubt, but the Mishna Berura (202:84) clarifies that this is only AFTER one has learned the halachot and done everything feasible to ascertain the beracha. If, at that stage, it is still not clear then 'shehakol' is permitted.

ואמר מר בר רב אשי: האי דובשא דתמרי מברכין עלויה 'שהכל נהיה בדברו'. מאי טעמא! זיעה בעלמא הוא. אמר ליה ההוא מרבנן לרבא: טרימא מהו (לש"י: ושס טרימא - כל דבר הכתוש קלת וחינו מרוסק)! אמר ליה: חשילתא ודאי קא אמרת. ואדכרתן מלתא הא דאמר רב אסי: האי תמרי של תרומה - מותר לעשות מהן טרימא, ואסור לעשות מהן שכר. והלכתא: תמרי ועבדינהו טרימא - מברכין עלוייהו בורא פרי העץ. מאי טעמא - במלתייהו קיימי כדמעיקרא.

ברכות לח.

2.

The Gemara rules that date honey gets the beracha 'shehakol', like all juices processed from the fruit. What about pressed and processed dates? The Gemara concludes that, as long as they remain in their original states, just pressed, they will be 'haetz'. Rashi explains that we are referring to something that was pressed but not pulped - merusak.

3. ירקות שדרכן להשלק, שלקן - מברך על מי שלק שלהן בורא פרי האדמה. והוא ששלקן לשתות מימיהן, שמימי השלקות כשלקות במקום שדרכן לשתותן. דבש תמרים מברכין עליו תחלה שהכל. אבל תמרים שמעכן ביד, והוציא גרעינין שלהן ועשאן כמו עיסה, מברך עליהן תחלה בורא פרי העץ ולבסוף ברכה אחת מעין שלש.

רמב"ם הלכות ברכות פרק ח הלכה ד

The Rambam rules that a vegetable broth remains 'borei peri ha' adama' even through one is drinking only the liquid. So too a date paste, even when made into a kind of dough, remains 'haetz'.

... ופירש רש"י טרימא דבר הכתוש קלת ואינו מרוסק. ומשמע מדבריו שאם היה מרוסק לגמרי אין מברכין עליו בורא פרי העץ. וכן נראה מדברי רבינו וכן כתוב בתרומת הדשן סימן כ"ט. אבל הרמב"ס (שם ה"ד) כתב תמרים שמיעכן ביד והוליא גרעינין שלהם ועשאם כמו עיסה מברך עליהם תחלה בורא פרי העץ ... וכתבו רבינו בסמוך וכתב דאפשר שגם ר"י מודה להרמב"ם:

בית יוסף אורח חיים סימן רב אות ז ד"ה תמרים שכתשן

The Beit Yosef understands this to be a machloket. According to Rashi and others, crushed fruits remain 'haetz' only if they have not be fully pulped into a paste. However, the Rambam rules that even fully pulped fruits are still 'haetz'.

.5 תמרים שמיעכן ביד ועשה מהם עיסה והוציא מהם גרעיניהם, אפילו הכי לא נשתנית ברכתן ומברך עליהם: בורא פרי העץ ולבסוף ברכה מעין שלש. הגה: לפי זה ה"ה לטווערן הנקרא פווידל"א מצרכין עליהס: צפה"ע. ויש אומריס לצרך עליהס שהכל (ת"ה סי' כ"ט וצ"י צשם הטור). וטוצ לחוש לכתחלה לצרך שהכל. אצל אם צירך צפה"ע ילא, כי כן נראה עיקר.

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות ברכת הפירות סימן רב סעיף ז

The Shulchan Aruch rules like the Rambam, that even puréed dates remain 'haetz'. The Rema adds that, accordingly, powidla - a plum jam prepared from unsweetened cooked plums¹⁰ - will also be 'haetz'. The Rema the brings a dissenting view that the correct beracha¹¹ is in fact 'shehakol', and rules that one should be concerned for this opinion and make 'shehakol'. However, if one made 'haetz', that will still work, since the first opinion is, even for the Rema, the main one.

הלכ' קי"ל כדעת המחבר דהיכא שממשן קיים לא נשתנית ברכתן. ורק בפאווידלא שאבד כל אורתו ולא ניכר כלל מה הוא אז לכתחלה מברך שהכל, וכהכרעת הרמ"א, דבברכה זו יולא על הכל בדיעבד. [אכן לענין ברכה אחרונה אין עלה]

משנה ברורה שם ס'ק מב

The Mishna Berura rules that the date paste is 'haetz' since it still consists of puréed dates. But the plum jam is 'shehakol' since it is totally changed from the original plums. And, of course, 'shehakol' will always cover 'haetz' bedieved, so there is nothing lost in saying 'shehakol'. However, for the beracha acharona, the position is trickier since borei nefashot does NOT cover al hamichiya/perot/gafen, even bedieved¹².

(מג) לברך שהכל – וע"כ מיני אגרע"ס וייגדע"ס ומאלינע"ס וכיו"ב שסוחטין אותן ומרקחין אותם בדבש ולוקע"ר מברכין עליהם שהכל כיון שהם מרוסקים ונימוחים לגמרי ואבד מהם לורתן. ובדיעבד אם בירך עליהם ברכתו הראויה ילא.

משנה ברורה שם ס'ק מג

The Mishna Berura rules that jams made from pulped and juiced fruits mixed with sugar are 'shehakol' (but bedieved 'haetz' will work).

^{10.} https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Powidl

^{11.} There is a debate in the Acharonim as to whether the Rema is saying this only on the powidla or also on the date paste. See MB 202:42.

^{12.} He suggests that, to avoid the halachic doubt, one should should also eat a proper shiur of food that is definitely 'borei nefashot' and another that is definitely 'al haperot'. If one cannot do so, then one can say 'al haperot' since even the Rema rules that this is the main view.

(מד) יצא - ואם רוב דרך אכילת אותן פירות הוא ע"י ריסוק, אף לכתחלה מברך ברכתו הראויה, בין לענין פה"ע או פרי האדמה. כגון מאכל שמבשלין מדלועין שקורין קירבעם, וכן אינגבע"ר, ושארי בשמים שחוקים שאוכלין עם לוקער מברכין בפה"א

משנה ברורה שם ס'ק מד

8.

The Mishna Berura then adds a very important point. If the NORMAL way of eating this fruit or vegetable is in the processed state, mixed with sugar, the beracha will remain 'haetz/ha' adama'.

- In practice, most Sefardim follow the ruling of the Shulchan Aruch that the beracha on date butter is 'haetz'. Ashkenazim follow the ruling of the Rema, that one should say 'shehakol', because of the doubt as to which opinion we should follow. In practice, Ashkenazim usually say 'haetz' when eating a product that has <u>some</u> of the consistency of the fruit, like jam containing recognizable fruit pieces, or "chunky" apple sauce, but say 'shehakol' before eating a completely smooth apple sauce, or a smooth jam, where the fruit has completely lost its consistency. This also applies to chunky mashed potato (ha'adama) as opposed to smooth potato purée (shehakol).
- Note that the 'shehakol' beracha on smooth apple sauce etc is a <u>safek</u>. That has important halachic implications. For example, someone eating a fruit and smooth apple sauce at the same time who recited 'haetz' on the fruit may not then make a beracha on the sauce in case it was covered. They should first recite 'shehakol' on the sauce and then 'haetz' on the fruit¹³. Alternatively, they should make the haetz on the fruit with specific intent to cover the sauce¹⁴.

C2] APPLICATIONS TO CHOCOLATE

As we noted above, chocolate is heavily processed. Will this affect its beracha?

עבה"ט סיים בזה שגם הוא נוהג לברך שהכל על קאווי וטייע כמנהג העולם. וגם על שעקלאדי כתב בדברי יוסף סי' י"ד לברך שהכל וכן עמא דבר.....

שערי תשובה סימן רב ס'ק יט

The Sha'arei Teshuva (1780-1820) writes that custom was for people to make 'shehakol' on chocolate. However, at that time, chocolate was ONLY a drink! Everyone agrees that the beracha on the liquid will be 'shehakol'.

10.

בענין שוקולד שנהוג לברך עליו שהכל, נו"נ בזה עם גדולי תורה. דבשלמא על משקה של קקאו ניחא מה שמברכין שהכל כמבואר בשע"ת סי' ר"ב ס"ק י"ט. אבל שוקולד הרי הוא ממש אוכל גמור! ומבואר להדיא בשו"ע או"ח סי' ר"ג סעי' ז' שעל בשמים שחוקים ומעורבים עם סוכר, הבשמים עיקר ומברך עליהם כדין ברכת אותם בשמים. ועי' במג"א סי' ר"ב ס"ק י"ח שכתב דכיון שהדרך הוא לכתוש ולשחוק הרי הם חשובים כקיימי במילתייהו.

וא"כ הרי גם קקאו דרך אכילתם רק ע"י כיתוש וריסוק <u>ויש לברך ע"ז בורא פרי העץ</u> אם הקקאו הוא עיקר וכ"ש כשהוא רוב. והפליאה היא ביותר על אחינו הספרדים שנוהגים כהמחבר (או"ח בסי ר"ב סעי זו" לברך בפה"ע גם על תמרים שנתמעכו ונשתנה צורתן. וחשבתי לומר דכיון שהקקאו עצמו אינו נאכל כלל כמו שהוא לא חי ולא מבושל, ועומד כרגיל להתערב עם דברים אחרים באופן שהוא רק מיעוט. ולכן אפשר דאפי' בכה"ג שאינו מיעוט אבל כיון שאינו ראוי לאכילה אלא ע"י תיקון ותערובת עם דברים אחרים אפשר דאין זה כ"כ חשוב. ואף שדרך אכילתו תמיד ע"י ריסוק אפי"ה מברכין ע"ז שהכל....

אך עדיין תמוה שהרי מבואר שגם על אינגבע"ר (קנמון) שחוקים שאוכלים עם צוקער מברכים בפה"ע ... אף על גב שגם אד עדיין תמוה שהרי מבואר שגם על אינגבע"ר (קנמון) שחיקה ונטפל לדברים אחרים ממש כמו קקאו ולכן צע"ג!

ועכ"פ אותם שמערבים קקאו עם סוכר יחד ואוכלין נראה שאם הרוב הוא קקאו צריכים ודאי לברך בפה"ע שהרי לא נהפך לדבר אחר ודומה ממש לאינגבע"ר וכדומה.

שו"ת מנחת שלמה חלק א סימן צא

11.

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach rules that the beracha on solid chocolate <u>should be</u> 'haetz'! Since this is the normal way we eat this fruit, and the chocolate is the actual substance of the fruit itself, the beracha remains 'haetz'. ¹⁵

..... וכיון שמחופין הא אינו יכול לברך תחלה על הצמוקין ויצטר<u>ך לכוין כשמברך שהכל על השאקאלאד</u> שלא לצאת בו על הצמוקין. ואם יש לו גם צמוקין שאינם מחופין או שאר מין העץ יברך על הצמוקין תחלה או על שאר מין העץ ואח"כ <u>יברך על השאקאלאד שהכל</u>.

שו"ת אגרות משה אורח חיים חלק ג סימן לא

Ray Moshe Feinstein rules that the beracha on chocolate is shehakol. (We will examine below the full teshuva on the issue of the chocolate coating on the raisins). What is the basis of the machloket?

^{13.} Ben Ish Chai, Pinchas #16. Some poskim are stricter on this and consider it to be an unnecessary beracha - beracha she'eino tzricha. Even though this is not a beracha levatala (since both berachot are halachically necessary given the way one structured them), there is a debate in the poskim as to whether, and when, one may engineer the need for an extra beracha that could have been avoided.

^{14.} This is less ideal since Ashkenazim rule that the lechatchila beracha on the source is 'shehakol' and 'haetz' is only bedieved.

^{15.} As we will see below, in practice, Ray Shlomo Zalman advised people to follow the minhag and make 'shehakol'.

C3] SUGAR AND SPICE

בשמים שחוקים ומעורבים עם סוקר, הבשמים עיקר. ומברך עליהם כדין ברכת אותם בשמים. (משנה ברורה ס'ק יד – היינו אף כשהם שחוקין ונימוחים לגמרי עד שאין ניכר דהם תארן הראשון כלל. אפ"ה לא נשתנית דרכתן עי"ז לכו"ע דדרך הדשמים לכתוש דאופן זה)

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות ברכת הפירות סימן רג סעיף ז

The Shulchan Aruch rules that the beracha on processed spices remains its original 'haetz/ha'adama' even though they have been processed and sugar has been added. The Mishna Berura stresses that, even though they have been totally processed and do not resemble their original form, since this is the normal way of eating them, the beracha remains.

על הסוקא"ר מברך שהכל. וכן המוצץ קנים מתוקות שהכל. (משנה ברורה ס'ק עד - דלא עדיפי מדבש תמרים דחשבינן ליה רק 13. כזיעה בעלמא וברכתו שהכל, וכ"ש בזה שנשתנו ע"י הבישול):

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות ברכת הפירות סימן רב סעיף טו

The Shulchan Aruch rules that the beracha on sugar is 'shehakol' since it is processed, boiled and is more akin to date honey which is shehakol.

.... בלוקער שלנו שנטשה מן ירקות שקורין בוריקע"ם כו"ע יודעין שזורעין אלפי שדות רק בשביל זה וגם הירקות הוא מין מיוחד שנקראים בוריקעם מתוקים, שעומדים העיקר רק להוליא מהן לוקער. א"כ ליבריך על הלוקער 'בפה"א' כמו על הבוריקעם בעלמם! ואין לנו טעם בזה לברך 'שהכל' אלא לפי סברא השניה שזכר הרמב"ס, והוא מפני שמשתנים ע"י האור. וס"ל להרמב"ם דלא תקנו ע"ז ברכת הפרי שממנה ילא, כיון שאין ניכר כלל לעין אדם שמפרי או מירק פלוני ילא דבר זה, שהרי הוא עכשיו כחתיכת מלח ואין לברך בכגון זה אלא 'שהכל'.

ביאור הלכה סימן רב

12.

The Mishna Berura rules that, even though sugar beet is made specifically to be eaten as sugar, and everyone knows this when they eat it, since the final product looks NOTHING like the original fruit, and no one would ever guess that it came from there, the beracha should be shehakol.

- After the sugar beets ripen, they are harvested, washed, and sliced into thin chips. The beet chips are then soaked in hot water for about an hour, which extracts the sugar from them and creates a strong sugar solution. Chalk is added to the sugar solution, which causes the non-sugar parts of the solution to clump together, so that they can be filtered out. The sugar solution is then evaporated to concentrate the sugar. Eventually, the sugar concentration is great enough to form crystals, which are then removed from the solution.
- Critically, the case of both sugar cane and sugar beet, the sugar is <u>extracted</u> from the stem or root, rather than being simply processed in its raw form.
- Rav Shlomo Zalman compares chocolate to ginger or spices, which keep their original beracha even after processing¹⁶. Rav Moshe may compare chocolate more to sugar, which gets the beracha 'shehakol'¹⁷, even though it is derived from a sugar beet cane or root.
- Also, the chocolate that we eat is usually less than 50% actual chocolate, adding to the grounds to say 'shehakol'. According to this reasoning, if the mixture were more than 50% chocolate it would be more likely to be 'haetz'.
- The almost-universal custom¹⁸ is to say 'shehakol' on chocolate. In practice, this was the ruling of Ray Shlomo Zalman too.
- If, however, one ate cocoa powder, the beracha is 'haetz'. Also, if one said 'haetz' or 'ha'adama' on chocolate, bedieved one is yotzei¹⁹.

D] THE BERACHA RISHONA ON CHOCOLATE-COATED RAISINS

זה הכלל - כל שהוא עיקר ועמו טפלה מברך על העיקר ופוטר את הטפלה.

משנה מסכת ברכות פרק ו משנה ז

15.

16. Rabbi Kagenoff proposes that even those poskim who rules that that the beracha on chocolate is 'haetz' should agree that white chocolate is 'shehakol', since it contains no cocoa solids. Cocoa butter should have the halacha of a liquid that is pressed out of a fruit, which is always 'shehakol'.

^{17.} Rabbi Kagenoff suggests other reasons for Rav Moshe's psak, including (i) because the chocolate undergoes so many changes and processes in its preparation, one should not consider the finished product a fruit at all; and (ii) since chocolate is liquefied and remains a liquid for most of its processing, it retains its status of being a liquid for hilchot berachot, and thus the correct beracha is 'shehakol'.

^{18.} This was the psak of Rav Shlomo Zalman in practice and was also the psak of Rav Eliyashiv and Rav Wosner (see VeZot Haberacha p 103).

^{19.} As such, if one is also saying 'haetz' or 'ha'adama' on other food, it is preferable to say the shehakol on the chocolate first so that there is no doubt as to whether it needs another beracha.

26. כל שהוא עיקר ועמו טפילה (פי' דבר בלתי נחשב), מברך על העיקר ופוטר את הטפילה, בין מברכה שלפניה בין מברכה שלאחריה. לא מיבעיא אם העיקר מעורב עם הטפל, אלא אפי כל אחד לבדו.

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות ברכת הפירות סימן ריב סעיף א

The general halachic rule is that where two distinct foods are eaten together, and one is coming to enhance the other, the beracha is made only on the main one (ikar) and this covers the enhancer (tofel). This applies whether they are presented separately (eg fries and ketchup) or as a mixture (eg apple pie).

- Hashkafically, this is also an important idea. The halacha is instructing us to assess before we eat what is primary and what is secondary. This skill to see the important distinction between the big issues and the small is essential in so many life scenarios!
- It also stresses the power of da'at the human will to fix a halachic reality.

17 או אפילו שניהם עיקרים אלא שהאחד מרובה מחבירו הרוב הוא העיקר.

משנה ברורה סימן ריב ס"ק א

18.

What if both are ikarim and one is not clearly coming to enhance the other? The Mishna Berura rules that in this case there is only one beracha - on the majority food.

- Based on this, it would seem that there should be ONE beracha on chocolate raisins.
 - If one relates to them as chocolate, with the inside fruit as a an enhancer, there will be one beracha of shehakol.
 - If one relates to it as a fruit/nut with a chocolate enhancer, eg a chocolate coated almond, it should be 'haetz'.
- If both are genuinely the ikar, it should go by the majority (probably the chocolate).
- However, Rav Moshe Feinstein did not agree!

בדבר צמוקין המחופין בשאקאלאד. י"ט טבת תשל"ב. מע"כ ידידי הרה"ג מהר"ר אפרים גרינבלאט שליט"א.

ובדבר הצימוקין המחופין בשאקאלאד, מה נחשב העיקר. הנה כעי"ז הוא נבאר"ח בסי' קס"ח סעיף ח' ונשנה בסימן רי"ב סעיף ב) במרקחת שנותנין על רקיקים דקים הוו הרקיקין טפלין, אך שם פי' המג"א ס"ק כ"ג שעושים הרקיקין שלא יטנפו הידים מהמרקחת. שלא שייך זה בצמוקין המחופין, דהנגיעה הוא בהשאקאלאד, וגם שם כשהמרקחת הוא על דובשנין תלינן שכוונתו הוא גם לאכול הדובשנין כדכתב המג"א בסק"ה ולהמחצה"ש מברך על שתיהם. ולהמ"ב בסימן קס"ח ס"ק מ"ה מברך על הדובשנין שהם העיקר עיין שם. ולכאורה דמי זה לדובשנין שגם הצמוקין הוא דבר טוב בפני עצמן אבל הא ודאי רוצה גם בהשאקאלאד מצד עצמו, וצריך לברך על שניהם. וכיון שמחופין הא אינו יכול לברך תחלה על הצמוקין ויצטרך לכוין כשמברך שהכל על השאקאלאד שלא לצאת בו על הצמוקין. ואם יש לו גם צמוקין שאינם מחופין או שאר מין העץ ואח"כ יברך על השאקאלאד שהכל.

שו"ת אגרות משה אורח חיים חלק ג סימן לא

Ray Moshe rules that since one wishes to eat BOTH the chocolate AND the raisin and neither is really tafel to the other and there is no halachic 'mixture', one must make <u>two</u> berachot on chocolate-coated raisins - first 'shehakol' on the chocolate (with intent <u>not</u> to cover the raisin) and then 'haetz' on the raisin.

• In practice, Rav Moshe advised, where possible, to make a 'haetz' on another fruit with intent to exempt the raisin, and then to make a shehakol on the chocolate raisin.

19. וכתבו האחרונים שם דבמדינותינו שנותנין מרקחת על הדובשנין [שקורין לעק"ך פלאדי"ן] שטובים הדובשנין למאכל בעזמן. אם כן כונתם גם בשביל אכילת הדובשנין וממילא הם העיקר ומברך עליהם במ"מ ופוטר המרקחת. ופשוט דדוקא שבעת אפייה נאפין ביחד אבל אם אפה הדובשנין לבד ואח"כ מניח עליהם מלמעלה המרקחת אין נעשין המרקחת טפילה להם שכונתו לאכול שניהם ואין המרקחת באין ללפת הדובשנין וזריך לברך גם על המרקחת:

משנה ברורה סימן קסח ס"ק מה

Rav Moshe is based on the idea that two ikarim which are NOT baked or cooked together still get TWO berachot.

- Many poskim disagree with this and rule that there should only be one beracha, either on the preferred ingredient or on whichever is greater in quantity.²⁰ If the chocolate is the majority and one said 'shehakol' with intent to cover the raisin, that will work. So too, if the raisin is the majority and one said 'haetz' with intent to cover the chocolate, that will work too²¹.
- The same will apply to other chocolate coated fruit.
- The beracha on a chocolate bar which includes nuts or fruit is shehakol, since the chocolate is the ikar.

^{20.} Yalkut Yosef, Vol. 3, pg 431; Vezot Haberacha pg. 97.

^{21.} If there is a doubt about which is the majority, even Rav Shlomo Zalman ruled to say 'shehakol' as one would normally do in case where the majority was unclear. This is notwithstanding his in principle position to make 'haetz' on chocolate. In practice, he went along with with minhag to make 'shehakol'

To download more source sheets and audio shiurim visit www.rabbimanning.com

20.

E] THE BERACHA ACHARONA ON CHOCOLATE-COATED RAISINS

- The normal rule is that one only makes a beracha acharona if one eats a *kezayit* of food within a *k'dei achilat pras* (3-4 minutes).
- According to Rabbi Pinchos Bodner's Halachos of K'zayis book this would be 30 chocolate raisins within 3-4 minutes.
- If one made shehakol, the beracha acharona will be 'borei nefashot'. Even if one made 'haetz', the beracha acharona will still normally be 'borei nefashot' since the kezayit is made from a combination of the '5 fruits' (raisins) and other fruits (chocolate).
- Similarly, if one followed Rav Moshe's psak and made 2 berachot at the start, the beracha acharona will normally be 'borei nefashot' (for the raisins and chocolate combined).
- However, if one made 'haetz' and then ate a kezayit of actual raisins (around 92!) within 3-4 minutes, the beracha acharona would be 'al hapeirot.²²



האוכל פחות מכזית בין מפת בין משאר אוכלים מברך תחלה ברכה הראויה לאותו המין ולאחריו אינו מברך כלל. ויש מסתפקים לומר שעל דבר שהוא כברייתו, כגון גרגיר של ענב או של רימון, שמברכין לאחריו אף על פי שאין בו כזית. לכך נכון ליזהר שלא לאכול בריה פחות מכזית. הגה: ולא מקרי בריה אלא אס אכלו כמות שהוא, אבל אס לקח הגרעין ממנו, לא מקרי בריה

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות ברכת הפירות סימן רי סעיף א

There is however a halachic position in the Rishonim that eating <u>one whole</u> piece of fruit (eg one grape or one olive) would always require a beracha acharona even if is less than a kezayit were eaten, on the basis that it has 'chashivut' as a 'birya'²³.

- On that basis, would one need to make a beracha acharona even on ONE chocolate raisin!?
- Rav Shlomo Zalman said no, since he ruled that the din of birya did not apply to a raisins²⁴. However, not all poskim agree²⁵.

F] CHOCOLATE-COATED ORANGE PEELS

• Peels of fruit which are normally eaten eg apple are 'haetz' since they are part of the fruit.

וע"כ יש ולטנין קליפת פאמערנלי"ן שטוגנין בדבש יש דעות [מג] בין האחרונים אם לברך עליהן שהכל או פה"ע ופרי האדמה. וע"כ יש לברך עליהן שהכל ובדיעבד אם בירך פה"ע או פה"א ילא

משנה ברורה סימן רב ס"ק לט

(מג) דהמגן אברהם והפנים מאירות והחיי אדם פסקו דיש לברך עליהן פרי העץ. והט"ז והבגדי ישע והגר"ז והיד הקטנה והמגן גבורים פסקו דיש לברך עליהן פרי האדמה. והעולת תמיד והאליה רבה והפרי מגדים פסקו דיש לברך עליהן שהכל.

שער הציון סימן רב ס"ק מג

The beracha on a regular orange peel is (probably) shehakol, although there are poskim that supported haetz and ha'adama.²⁶

• Where the inside is something which is not normally eaten on its own eg orange peels, the beracha for a <u>chocolate coated version</u> is 'shehakol'.

- 22. Based on Rabbi Bodner's kezayit pictures, he seems to be assuming that a chocolate coated raisin is approximately two-thirds chocolate and one-third raisin.
- 23. For the same reason one whole insect is not batel in a mixture even if less than 1/60.
- 24. Presumably since they had lost much of their original volume in the drying process.
- 25. Seehttps://www.star-k.org/articles/kashrus-kurrents/615/good-things-come-in-small-packages/

^{26.} Taz (OC 204:15) writes that one should recite 'ha'adama', since the Gemara rules that this is the beracha for the peel of the caper bush fruit. The Taz maintains that the same holds true for other peels as well. The Magen Avraham (202:17) writes that one should recite 'haetz'. Unlike the peel of the caper which separates from the fruit while it grows, the orange peel is part of the fruit. The Pri Megadim (202:17) writes that the beracha is 'shehakol'. He explains that the ikar (main ingredient) in candied orange peels is the sugar or honey, which is shehakol. The Mishnah Berura concludes that because of the doubt, one should recite shehakol, since it is the most inclusive bracha. However, bedieved, if one recited 'haetz' or 'ha'adama', they may rely on the other opinions and eat the peel.

5781 – אברהם מנינג rabbi@rabbimanning.com 8

G] OTHER HALACHIC ISSUES REGARDING CHOCOLATE

There are many other potential halachic issues concerning chocolate 27 . They include:

- · Drinking hot chocolate before tefilla.
- · Chocolate during a meal does it get its own beracha?
- · Beracha Acharona on a hot chocolate drink.
- Coloring food/drink with chocolate on Shabbat.
- Breaking chocolate letters on Shabbat.
- Kashering chocolate factories see footnotes above.
- · Bishul akum and chocolate see footnotes above.
- The status of milk powder as chalav akum see footnotes above.
- Eating chocolate money with 'In God we Trust' printed on it28.

^{27.} Most of these also relate to other food - see https://www.theyeshivaworld.com/news/headlines-breaking-stories/362964/the-halachos-and-kashrus-of-chocolate.html for a long and source-based article dealing with many of these issues.

^{28.} While some poskim rule that lechatchila one should not not buy such chocolates, others say that there is no problem at all since is permitted to erase the name of God in a different language.